



## The smooth ideal



---

Benjamin Miller  
Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster  
(joint work with Clinton Conley and John Clemens)

---

Computational Prospects of Infinity II  
July 21<sup>st</sup>, 2011

# Part I

Equivalence relations

# I. Equivalence relations

Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

Suppose that  $X$  and  $Y$  are Hausdorff spaces.

# I. Equivalence relations

## Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

Suppose that  $X$  and  $Y$  are Hausdorff spaces.

Suppose that  $E$  and  $F$  are equivalence relations on  $X$  and  $Y$ .

# I. Equivalence relations

Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

## Definition

We say  $E$  is **countable** if its equivalence classes are countable.

# I. Equivalence relations

## Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

### Definition

We say  $E$  is **countable** if its equivalence classes are countable.

### Definition

We say  $E$  is **uncountable** if its equivalence classes are uncountable.

# I. Equivalence relations

## Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

### Definition

We say that  $A \subseteq X$  is **analytic** if there is a closed set  $F \subseteq \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}}$  and a continuous surjection  $\varphi: F \rightarrow A$ .

# I. Equivalence relations

## Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

### Definition

We say that  $A \subseteq X$  is **analytic** if there is a closed set  $F \subseteq \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}}$  and a continuous surjection  $\varphi: F \rightarrow A$ .

### Definition

We say that  $B \subseteq X$  is  **$\aleph_0$ -universally Baire** if for every continuous function  $\pi: \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}} \rightarrow X$ , the set  $\pi^{-1}(B)$  has the Baire property.

# I. Equivalence relations

## Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

### Definition

A **homomorphism** from  $E$  to  $F$  is a function  $\pi: X \rightarrow Y$  such that

$$w E x \Rightarrow \pi(w) F \pi(x).$$

# I. Equivalence relations

## Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

### Definition

A **homomorphism** from  $E$  to  $F$  is a function  $\pi: X \rightarrow Y$  such that

$$w E x \Rightarrow \pi(w) F \pi(x).$$

### Definition

A **cohomomorphism** from  $E$  to  $F$  is a function  $\pi: X \rightarrow Y$  such that

$$\neg w E x \Rightarrow \neg \pi(w) F \pi(x).$$

# I. Equivalence relations

Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

## Definition

A **reduction** of  $E$  to  $F$  is a function which is both a homomorphism and a cohomomorphism.

# I. Equivalence relations

## Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

### Definition

A **reduction** of  $E$  to  $F$  is a function which is both a homomorphism and a cohomomorphism.

### Definition

An **embedding** of  $E$  into  $F$  is an injective reduction.

# I. Equivalence relations

Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

We will use the natural generalizations to sequences of relations.

# I. Equivalence relations

## Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

### Definition

The **diagonal** on  $X$  is the equivalence relation  $\Delta(X)$  on  $X$  given by

$$\Delta(X) = \{(w, x) \in X \times X \mid w = x\}.$$

# I. Equivalence relations

## Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

### Definition

The **diagonal** on  $X$  is the equivalence relation  $\Delta(X)$  on  $X$  given by

$$\Delta(X) = \{(w, x) \in X \times X \mid w = x\}.$$

### Definition

We say  $E$  is **smooth** if there is a Borel reduction of  $E$  to  $\Delta(2^{\mathbb{N}})$ .

# I. Equivalence relations

## Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

### Definition

The **diagonal** on  $X$  is the equivalence relation  $\Delta(X)$  on  $X$  given by

$$\Delta(X) = \{(w, x) \in X \times X \mid w = x\}.$$

### Definition

We say  $E$  is **smooth** if there is a Borel reduction of  $E$  to  $\Delta(2^{\mathbb{N}})$ .

### Definition

We say that a set  $W \subseteq X$  is  **$E$ -smooth** if  $E \upharpoonright W$  is smooth.

# I. Equivalence relations

## Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

### Definition

A **partial transversal** of  $E$  is a set which intersects every equivalence class of  $E$  in at most one point.

# I. Equivalence relations

## Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

### Definition

A **partial transversal** of  $E$  is a set which intersects every equivalence class of  $E$  in at most one point.

### Definition

When  $E$  is countable, the **smooth ideal** of  $E$  is the  $\sigma$ -ideal  $\mathcal{I}_E$  on  $X$  generated by the family of Borel partial transversals.

# I. Equivalence relations

Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

## Definition

The equivalence relation  $E_0$  on  $2^{\mathbb{N}}$  is given by

$$x E_0 y \Leftrightarrow \exists m \in \mathbb{N} \forall n \geq m \ x(n) = y(n).$$

# I. Equivalence relations

Two fundamental theorems



## Theorem 1 (Silver)

Suppose that  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space and  $E$  is a co-analytic equivalence relation on  $X$ . Then exactly one of the following holds:

- 1 The equivalence relation  $E$  has only countably many classes.
- 2 There is a continuous embedding of  $\Delta(2^{\mathbb{N}})$  into  $E$ .

# I. Equivalence relations

Two fundamental theorems



## Theorem 1 (Silver)

Suppose that  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space and  $E$  is a co-analytic equivalence relation on  $X$ . Then exactly one of the following holds:

- 1 The equivalence relation  $E$  has only countably many classes.
- 2 There is a continuous embedding of  $\Delta(2^{\mathbb{N}})$  into  $E$ .

## Theorem 2 (Harrington-Kechris-Louveau)

Suppose that  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space and  $E$  is a Borel equivalence relation on  $X$ . Then exactly one of the following holds:

- 1 The equivalence relation  $E$  is smooth.
- 2 There is a continuous embedding of  $E_0$  into  $E$ .

# I. Equivalence relations

Corresponding canonization theorems



## Theorem 3 (Galvin)

Suppose that  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space,  $E$  is a co-analytic equivalence relation on  $X$ , and  $F$  is an  $\aleph_0$ -universally Baire equivalence relation on  $X$ . If  $E$  has uncountably many classes, then there is a non-empty perfect set  $P \subseteq X$  with the property that  $E \upharpoonright P = \Delta(P)$  and  $F \upharpoonright P \in \{\Delta(P), P \times P\}$ .

# I. Equivalence relations

Corresponding canonization theorems



## Theorem 3 (Galvin)

Suppose that  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space,  $E$  is a co-analytic equivalence relation on  $X$ , and  $F$  is an  $\aleph_0$ -universally Baire equivalence relation on  $X$ . If  $E$  has uncountably many classes, then there is a non-empty perfect set  $P \subseteq X$  with the property that  $E \upharpoonright P = \Delta(P)$  and  $F \upharpoonright P \in \{\Delta(P), P \times P\}$ .

## Theorem 4 (Kanovei-Zapletal)

Suppose that  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space,  $E$  is a Borel equivalence relation on  $X$ , and  $F$  is an  $\aleph_0$ -universally Baire equivalence relation on  $X$ . If  $E$  is non-smooth, then there is an  $E$ -non-smooth perfect set  $P \subseteq X$  for which  $F \upharpoonright P \in \{\Delta(P), E \upharpoonright P, P \times P\}$ .

# I. Equivalence relations

## Combinations of dichotomy theorems

### Theorem 5

Suppose  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space and  $E, F$  are co-analytic equivalence relations on  $X$ . Then exactly one of the following holds:

- The set  $X$  is the union of countably many classes of  $E$  and  $F$ .
- There is a continuous embedding of  $(\Delta(2^{\mathbb{N}}), \Delta(2^{\mathbb{N}}))$  into  $(E, F)$ .

# I. Equivalence relations

## Combinations of dichotomy theorems

### Theorem 5

Suppose  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space and  $E, F$  are co-analytic equivalence relations on  $X$ . Then exactly one of the following holds:

- The set  $X$  is the union of countably many classes of  $E$  and  $F$ .
- There is a continuous embedding of  $(\Delta(2^{\mathbb{N}}), \Delta(2^{\mathbb{N}}))$  into  $(E, F)$ .

### Theorem 6

Suppose  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space and  $E, F$  are Borel equivalence relations on  $X$ . Then exactly one of the following holds:

- There is a smooth equivalence relation  $E'$  on  $X$  such that  $[x]_{E \cap F} \subseteq [x]_{E'} \subseteq [x]_E$  or  $[x]_{E \cap F} \subseteq [x]_{E'} \subseteq [x]_F$ .
- There is a continuous embedding of  $(E_0, E_0)$  into  $(E, F)$ .

# I. Equivalence relations

Basic notions concerning quotient spaces

Suppose  $F \subseteq E$  are countable Borel equivalence relations on  $X$ .

# I. Equivalence relations

Basic notions concerning quotient spaces

## Definition

We say that a set  $B \subseteq X/F$  is **Borel** if  $\bigcup B$  is Borel.

# I. Equivalence relations

Basic notions concerning quotient spaces

## Definition

We say that a set  $B \subseteq X/F$  is **Borel** if  $\bigcup B$  is Borel.

## Definition

A **partial quasi-transversal** of  $E/F$  is a set whose intersection with each equivalence class of  $E/F$  is finite.

# I. Equivalence relations

Basic notions concerning quotient spaces

## Definition

When  $E/F$  is countable, the **quasi-smooth ideal** of  $E/F$  is the  $\sigma$ -ideal  $\mathcal{I}_{E/F}$  generated by the family of Borel partial quasi-transversals.

# I. Equivalence relations

Basic notions concerning quotient spaces

## Definition

When  $E/F$  is countable, the **quasi-smooth ideal** of  $E/F$  is the  $\sigma$ -ideal  $\mathcal{I}_{E/F}$  generated by the family of Borel partial quasi-transversals.

## Definition

We say  $E/F$  is **quasi-smooth** if  $X/F$  is in  $\mathcal{I}_{E/F}$ .

# I. Equivalence relations

More combinations of dichotomy theorems

## Theorem 7

Suppose that  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space,  $E$  is a countable Borel equivalence relation on  $X$ , and  $F$  is a Borel equivalence relation on  $X$ . Then exactly one of the following holds:

- The equivalence relation  $E/(E \cap F)$  is quasi-smooth.
- There is a continuous embedding of  $(E_0, \Delta(2^{\mathbb{N}}))$  into  $(E, F)$ .

# I. Equivalence relations

More combinations of dichotomy theorems

## Theorem 7

Suppose that  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space,  $E$  is a countable Borel equivalence relation on  $X$ , and  $F$  is a Borel equivalence relation on  $X$ . Then exactly one of the following holds:

- The equivalence relation  $E/(E \cap F)$  is quasi-smooth.
- There is a continuous embedding of  $(E_0, \Delta(2^{\mathbb{N}}))$  into  $(E, F)$ .

## Theorem 8

Suppose that  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space,  $E$  is an uncountable Borel equivalence relation on  $X$ , and  $F$  is a countable Borel equivalence relation on  $X$ . Then the following are equivalent:

- There is a continuous embedding of  $E_0$  into  $E$ .
- There is a continuous embedding of  $(E_0, \Delta(2^{\mathbb{N}}))$  into  $(E, F)$ .

# Part II

Ideals

## II. Ideals

Basic notions concerning ideals

Suppose that  $\mathcal{I}$  and  $\mathcal{J}$  are ideals on  $X$  and  $Y$ .

## II. Ideals

### Basic notions concerning ideals

#### Definition

A **homomorphism** from  $\mathcal{I}$  to  $\mathcal{J}$  is a function  $\pi: X \rightarrow Y$  such that

$$B \in \mathcal{I} \Rightarrow \pi(B) \in \mathcal{J}.$$

## II. Ideals

### Basic notions concerning ideals

#### Definition

A **homomorphism** from  $\mathcal{I}$  to  $\mathcal{J}$  is a function  $\pi: X \rightarrow Y$  such that

$$B \in \mathcal{I} \Rightarrow \pi(B) \in \mathcal{J}.$$

#### Definition

A **cohomomorphism** from  $\mathcal{I}$  to  $\mathcal{J}$  is a function  $\pi: X \rightarrow Y$  such that

$$B \notin \mathcal{I} \Rightarrow \pi(B) \notin \mathcal{J}.$$

## II. Ideals

### Basic notions concerning ideals

#### Definition

A **reduction** of  $\mathcal{I}$  to  $\mathcal{J}$  is a function which is both a homomorphism and a cohomomorphism.

## II. Ideals

### Basic notions concerning ideals

#### Definition

A **reduction** of  $\mathcal{I}$  to  $\mathcal{J}$  is a function which is both a homomorphism and a cohomomorphism.

#### Definition

An **embedding** of  $\mathcal{I}$  into  $\mathcal{J}$  is an injective reduction.

## II. Ideals

A question

### Definition

We say that  $\mathcal{I}$  is **cohomogeneous** if for every Borel set  $B \notin \mathcal{I}$ , there is a Borel cohomomorphism from  $\mathcal{I}$  to  $\mathcal{I} \upharpoonright B$ .

## II. Ideals

A question



### Definition

We say that  $\mathcal{I}$  is **cohomogeneous** if for every Borel set  $B \notin \mathcal{I}$ , there is a Borel cohomomorphism from  $\mathcal{I}$  to  $\mathcal{I} \upharpoonright B$ .

### Question (Zapletal)

Are there naturally occurring non-cohomogeneous  $\sigma$ -ideals?

## II. Ideals

### Hyperfinite equivalence relations

#### Definition

We say that  $E$  is **hyperfinite** if there is an increasing sequence of finite Borel equivalence relations  $F_n$  on  $X$  such that  $E = \bigcup_{n \in \mathbb{N}} F_n$ .

## II. Ideals

### Hyperfiniteness relations



#### Definition

We say that  $E$  is **hyperfinite** if there is an increasing sequence of finite Borel equivalence relations  $F_n$  on  $X$  such that  $E = \bigcup_{n \in \mathbb{N}} F_n$ .

#### Theorem 9 (Dougherty-Jackson-Kechris)

Suppose that  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space and  $E$  is a countable Borel equivalence relation on  $X$ . Then  $E$  is hyperfinite if and only if there is a Borel embedding of  $E$  into  $E_0$ .

## II. Ideals

Two more questions

### Corollary 10

Suppose that  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space and  $E$  is a hyperfinite equivalence relation on  $X$ . Then for every analytic set  $A \notin \mathcal{I}_E$ , there is a Borel embedding of  $\mathcal{I}_E$  into  $\mathcal{I}_E \upharpoonright A$ , so  $\mathcal{I}_E$  is cohomogeneous.

## II. Ideals

Two more questions

Question

Can  $\mathcal{I}_E$  fail to be cohomogeneous when  $E$  is not hyperfinite?

## II. Ideals

Two more questions

Question

Can  $\mathcal{I}_E$  fail to be cohomogeneous when  $E$  is not hyperfinite?

Question

More generally, how much of  $E$  is encoded in  $\mathcal{I}_E$ ?

## **Part III**

Equivalence relations and ideals

### III. Equivalence relations and ideals

Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

Suppose again that  $E$  and  $F$  are equivalence relations on  $X$  and  $Y$ .

# III. Equivalence relations and ideals

## Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

### Definition

A **quasi-homomorphism** from  $E$  to  $F$  is a homomorphism from a finite-index subequivalence relation of  $E$  to  $F$ .

### III. Equivalence relations and ideals

#### Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

##### Definition

A **quasi-homomorphism** from  $E$  to  $F$  is a homomorphism from a finite-index subequivalence relation of  $E$  to  $F$ .

##### Definition

We say that a quasi-homomorphism  $\pi: X \rightarrow Y$  from  $E$  to  $F$  is **smooth-to-one** if for all  $y \in Y$  the set  $\pi^{-1}(\{y\})$  is  $E$ -smooth.

# III. Equivalence relations and ideals

## Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

### Definition

A **quasi-cohomomorphism** from  $E$  to  $F$  is a cohomomorphism from  $E$  to a finite-index subequivalence relation of  $F$ .

### III. Equivalence relations and ideals

#### Basic notions concerning equivalence relations

##### Definition

A **quasi-cohomomorphism** from  $E$  to  $F$  is a cohomomorphism from  $E$  to a finite-index subequivalence relation of  $F$ .

##### Definition

A **quasi-reduction** of  $E$  to  $F$  is a function which is both a quasi-homomorphism and a quasi-cohomomorphism.

# III. Equivalence relations and ideals

## Answers

### Theorem 11

Suppose that  $X$  and  $Y$  are analytic Hausdorff spaces and  $E$  and  $F$  are countable Borel equivalence relations on  $X$  and  $Y$ . Then the following are equivalent:

- There is a Borel cohomomorphism from  $\mathcal{I}_E$  to  $\mathcal{I}_F$ .
- There is a smooth-to-one Borel quasi-homomorphism from  $E$  to  $F$ .

# III. Equivalence relations and ideals

## Answers

### Theorem 12

Suppose that  $X$  is an analytic Hausdorff space and  $E$  is a countable Borel equivalence relation on  $X$ . Then the following are equivalent:

- The  $\sigma$ -ideal  $\mathcal{I}_E$  is cohomogeneous.
- The equivalence relation  $E$  is hyperfinite.

# III. Equivalence relations and ideals

## Answers

### Theorem 13

Suppose that  $X$  and  $Y$  are analytic Hausdorff spaces and  $E$  and  $F$  are countable Borel equivalence relations on  $X$  and  $Y$ . Then the following are equivalent:

- There is a Borel reduction of  $\mathcal{I}_E$  to  $\mathcal{I}_F$ .
- There is a Borel quasi-reduction of  $E$  to  $F$ .

# Bibliography

R. Dougherty, S. Jackson, and A.S. Kechris, *The structure of hyperfinite Borel equivalence relations*. Transactions of the American Mathematical Society, **341**, 193–225 (1994)

L. Harrington, A.S. Kechris, and A. Louveau. *A Glimm-Effros dichotomy for Borel equivalence relations*. Journal of the American Mathematical Society, **3** (4), 903–928 (1990)

V.G. Kanoveř and J. Zapletal. *Canonizing Borel equivalence relations on Polish spaces*. Preprint (2007)

J. Zapletal. *Forcing Idealized*. Cambridge Tracts in Mathematics, **174**. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge (2008)